

MICHIGAN LAW REVIEW VOLUME 107 (2008-09)
ASSOCIATE EDITOR SELECTION POLICY

The *Law Review's* primary goal is to select a staff of hardworking individuals with strong analytical and writing skills who will work cooperatively and enthusiastically to produce a scholarly journal. We believe our selection procedures identify students capable of successfully performing the responsibilities of a *Law Review* editor.

During the first year on the *Law Review*, Associate Editors spend approximately 150 hours gathering and citechecking the sources of works scheduled for publication. In addition, each Associate Editor researches and writes a publishable student Note. In the second year, Contributing Editors and Editorial Board members select, proofread, citecheck, and edit *Law Review* material. To this end, we consider strong writing skills, careful editing, and the ability to construct lucid, cogent arguments to be core requirements for any successful *Law Review* member.

The *Law Review* is a community with a purpose. We advance legal scholarship by presenting a range of work characterized by breadth, depth, and excellence. The *Law Review* also serves the University of Michigan Law School as a training ground for tomorrow's legal scholars and as an outward-looking face of the institution. Fulfilling our responsibilities requires the energy and care of many people working in concert. Teamwork and dedication to the organization are crucial to the *Law Review*. Thus, the *Law Review* seeks Associate Editors who have demonstrated a strong work ethic and commitment to the betterment of the Law School community. We also seek diversity among our Associate Editors in terms of life experiences, interest areas, and viewpoints. This diversity provides us with a wider range of expertise upon which we can draw in the selection and strengthening of publishable academic work. Diversity also enhances the educational experience of the *Law Review* community. The *Law Review* therefore seeks Associate Editors who are not only intelligent and capable, but who will contribute to the staff and publication as a whole.

We remind all applicants that membership on the *Law Review* is a significant commitment. We believe, however, that the experience of working on a journal is rewarding and well worth the time and effort it requires.

This year, the *Law Review* will select approximately 45 incoming Associate Editors from among the first-year class and eligible joint-degree students. All students in joint-degree programs of at least four years who spend their second year outside the Law School may apply for a position on the *Law Review* after either their first or second year, but they may apply only once. A joint-degree candidate must complete her first year on the *Law Review* immediately after she is accepted, but she may choose to complete her second year on the *Law Review* immediately after her first year or to defer for a year. A joint degree candidate may run for Editorial Board in either scenario, but she may run only once. Transfer students will receive information regarding the application in the fall.

MICHIGAN LAW REVIEW VOLUME 107 (2008-09)
ASSOCIATE EDITOR APPLICATION

The *Law Review* application process is blind; student reviewers will know applicants only by their ticket numbers. Thus, no member of the *Law Review* will know what combination of factors, including grades, led to any individual's acceptance to the *Law Review*. In order to preserve the integrity of the blind grading procedures, applicants should not include in their submissions their names, university student ID numbers, social security numbers, or any other unique identifiers. Once the incoming Associate Editor class is chosen, all ticket numbers linking applicants to their applications will be destroyed.

Please direct questions regarding application to the *Law Review* to Managing Editor Stefan Atkinson, stefanat@umich.edu, or mlrapplcations@umich.edu.

I. Stage One: Online Application

There are two stages to a student's application to the *Law Review*. Stage One requires applicants to:

- (1) complete the online Journals Application and obtain a Ticket Number;
- (2) print a copy of the Application confirmation page or email; and
- (3) print a copy of the Memorandum of Understanding & Release Form ("MOU"), which can be accessed via a link on that confirmation page and email.

First, applicants must submit their contact information via the Journals Application link located at http://sitemaker.umich.edu/MLR_application. As soon as an applicant submits her application, she will receive a Ticket Number. The online Journals Application will be available from **Monday, April 7, 2008 at 9:00 am E.D.T. until Wednesday, April 16, 2008 at 5:00 pm E.D.T.** A student will be unable to complete her *Law Review* application if she does not submit her application on this website before the 5:00 pm deadline on April 16.

Applicants can update their submitted online Journals Application information at any time before the April 16 deadline. If an update is made, the contact information will be updated, but the applicant's Ticket Number will remain the same. Once an applicant has submitted or updated her online Journal Application, she will be directed to a confirmation page and will receive a confirmation email. Both the confirmation page and confirmation email will contain the applicant's assigned Ticket Number and application information.

Second, applicants must print a copy of either the confirmation page or confirmation email. **If a problem arises regarding your application, you must be able to produce this printed copy.**

Third, each applicant also must print the MOU, a form that acknowledges the commitment *Law Review* members undertake and authorizes the *Law Review* Business Manager Maureen Bishop, a non-student member of the Michigan Law School staff, to access the applicant's first-year grades. The MOU can be accessed through a link that will appear on both the confirmation page and confirmation email.

Applicants who fail to complete any part of Stage One will not be considered for selection as an Associate Editor during Stage Two.

II. Stage Two: Writing Competition

Stage Two requires applicants to:

- (1) turn in their signed MOU in return for the Writing Competition materials; and
- (2) submit a writing sample on an assigned topic (the “Writing Competition” or “Competition”), a Pledge, and two short essays (“Short Essays”).

First, applicants must sign and submit the MOU in return for the Writing Competition materials. These materials will be available for pickup from the Publication Center, **371 Legal Research**, beginning on **Thursday, May 1, 2008 at 9:00 am E.D.T.**, and will remain available from 9 am to 5 pm, weekdays only, until the Writing Competition deadline of **Monday, May 12, 2008 at 5:00 pm E.D.T.** In addition to the signed MOU, in order to receive the Writing Competition materials, applicants will need a valid University of Michigan ID, and \$20 to cover the cost of printing those materials.

Second, applicants must submit their completed Writing Competition, Pledge, and Short Essays by **Monday, May 12, 2008 at 5:00 pm E.D.T.** The Writing Competition, Pledge, and Short Essays must either be postmarked (in one envelope), or turned in to the Publication Center, **371 Legal Research**, by this deadline. **This is a firm deadline and will be enforced without exception.**

The Writing Competition is not designed to measure objective knowledge. Rather, it measures clarity of thought and argument, precision of writing, use of legal texts to support arguments, and accuracy of citation form.

The Writing Competition materials will be sufficient to enable an applicant to prepare a successful entry. **Outside research is not allowed.** Applicants should, however, consult *The Bluebook* (18th ed.), and also may consult *Black's Law Dictionary*, any manual of style, and the *Bluebooking* Guide on the Application website (http://sitemaker.umich.edu/mlr_application).

Entries will be identified only by the ticket numbers that applicants received when they submitted their Stage One applications. Entries may not include the applicant's name, social security number, or other identifying information.

Each applicant must sign a Pledge, included in the Writing Competition packet, pledging not to seek or receive any assistance in research, reasoning, argumentation, or writing. The terms of this Pledge should be interpreted broadly. If an applicant needs to use professional typing and word processing services, such services may not include editing in any manner whatsoever. The applicant must citecheck footnotes without the assistance of computer programs or other individuals.

Each Applicant must submit two 400-word essays with their Writing Competitions and Pledge. These essays must respond to the two questions that appear later in this document and will be reproduced in the Writing Competition materials. These essays *must* be on the same page of paper, front side only. (You may have to alter your margins in order to meet

this requirement.) Six copies of the Personal Essays should be submitted. Applicants must also submit six copies of their Writing Competition. Again, the Writing Competition, Pledge, and Short Essays must be turned in no later than May 12, 2008 at 5:00 pm E.D.T.

All applicants must complete the Writing Competition, Pledge, and Short Essays to be considered for *Law Review* membership. We believe that a willingness and desire to write and perform legal research is the most essential characteristic for effective participation on the *Law Review*. Thus, all applicants' Writing Competition submissions must constitute a serious, good-faith effort. Applications that do not demonstrate such a commitment will not gain acceptance, regardless of the quality of the remainder of the application. **High grades do not guarantee an applicant a position on *Law Review*.**

III. Not Being Able to Pick Up the Writing Competition Materials in Person; Submitting Writing Competitions from Outside of the United States

Applicants who are unable to pick up the Writing Competition materials in person, and applicants who plan to submit their Writing Competition, Pledge, and Short Essays from outside of the United States must contact Maureen Bishop, maureena@umich.edu, before **5:00 pm E.D.T. on April 16, 2008**. An applicant's failure to contact Maureen about either not being able to pick up the materials in person, or being out of the country when submitting their Writing Competition, Pledge, and Short Essays may render *Michigan Law Review* unable to review their application.

IV. Writing on to the *Law Review* as a Second-Year Student

The *Michigan Law Review* publishes Notes written by its members. We also encourage Michigan Law students who have a strong interest in publishing a Note, but who have not joined the *Law Review* through the Associate Editor selection process at the end of the first year of law school, to consult with our Managing Editor about the possibility of publishing in the *Law Review*. Those who complete a publishable Note within their second year as a student at the Law School may be eligible to become Associate Editors of the *Law Review* during their third year. The *Law Review* does publish Notes from nonmembers after their second year; however, such students are not eligible to become members of the *Law Review*.

The above policy is subject to the details and deadlines set forth in the *Michigan Law Review* Write-On Policy. You may obtain more information about writing-on and publishing in the *Michigan Law Review* by contacting the Managing Editor Stefan Atkinson at stefanat@umich.edu.

V. Timeline

The following is a timeline of important dates:

- Monday, April 7** Journals Application, Ticket Numbers, and Memorandum of Understanding and Information Release available at https://sitemaker.umich.edu/MLR_application.
- Wednesday, April 16** Journals Application due online by 5 pm E.D.T. **Print a copy of the confirmation page or email, and the MOU.** If you cannot pick up your Writing Competition materials in person, or if you will be submitting the Writing Competition from outside the United States, you **MUST** contact Maureen Bishop, maureena@umich.edu, by 5 pm E.D.T. on April 16.
- Thursday, May 1** Writing Competition materials available for purchase at the Publication Center, **371 Legal Research**, at 9 am E.D.T. In order to receive the materials, applicants must turn in their signed MOU, and show a valid U of M ID. The packet will be available from 9 am to 5 pm from Thursday, May 1 through Monday, May 12. It will not be available on weekend days.
- Monday, May 12** Writing Competition, Pledge, and Short Essays due at 5 pm E.D.T. Specific directions for formatting, copying and mailing the Pledge, six copies of the Writing Competition, and six copies of the Short Essays are included in the Writing Competition materials.

MICHIGAN LAW REVIEW VOLUME 107 (2008-09)
ASSOCIATE EDITOR SELECTION PROCEDURES

I. FACTORS IN THE SELECTION OF ASSOCIATE EDITORS

In evaluating applicants, the *Law Review* will consider the following materials:

1. A completed Writing Competition.
2. The applicant's individual grades from the seven required first-year courses (civil procedure, contracts, criminal law, constitutional law, legal practice, property, torts).
3. A 400-word essay with the following instructions:

The *Michigan Law Review* would like to know about any academic experience, leadership experience, or other life experience, skills, or training that you believe would be particularly useful to your work on the journal. Please tell us about any such experiences, attributes, or achievements that demonstrate your fitness for work on the journal as an editor, administrator, and/or legal scholar.

4. A 400-word essay with the following instructions:

One of your most important duties to the *Law Review* will be to write and publish a Note. A Note is a student-written article that attempts to advance an innovative approach or solution to an interesting, unsettled legal issue. Please describe a topic you might select for your Note. It should be an unanswered question in some area of the law, but you need not have a well-informed position on it at this time. Please tell us why you think the issue merits further scholarly debate and what value a Note on this topic would contribute to the *Law Review*. You will not be bound by your proposed topic if you are accepted onto the *Law Review*. However, choosing a topic thoughtfully demonstrates your commitment to creating publishable scholarship, and it will significantly improve your Note-writing experience as an Associate Editor of the *Law Review*.

II. SELECTION PROCEDURE

A. Sorting of Competitions

During the sorting of applications, an initial check will be made to ensure that applicants have met the deadline and followed the explicit directions provided in the Writing Competition materials. Those who have missed the deadline, not abided by all the directions, or submitted an otherwise incomplete application, will be removed from consideration for the *Law Review*.

B. Round 1: Writing Competition Grading

Round 1 will only consider each applicant's Writing Competition. Each applicant's Writing Competition will be graded by five *Law Review* members serving as writing graders. The factors they will consider are (1) reasoning and support, (2) writing style, and (3) structure and organization. A grading guide will be provided to maintain consistency across graders.

The writing graders will work independently and will have no knowledge of the identity of each applicant. Graders will consider unique sets of Competitions, but the sets necessarily will overlap in order to provide each Competition with five grades. Using the three factors outlined above as a guide, each writing grader will assign the Competitions in her stack an A, B, or C grade. Graders will not be allowed to assign As to more than 25 percent of the Competitions in their stack.

Two *Law Review* members serving as citechecking graders will grade the entire pool of competitions for citation form. The citechecking graders will each grade half of the submissions using a grading guide and a standardized key to citations for all of the sources in the Writing Competition. The citechecking graders will also assign each Competition in their group an A, B, or C grade. Again, citechecking graders will not be allowed to assign As to more than 25 percent of the Competitions they grade. Each Competition will receive one citation grade. Citations are an essential element of an applicant's overall Writing Competition score.

At this point, each Competition's highest and lowest writing grades will be dropped, leaving each Competition with 3 writing grades and one citation grade. Any applicant whose combined Writing Competition score falls in the weakest 25 percent of the applicant pool will be rejected and removed from the pool before Round 2.

C. Round 2: Selection of Associate Editors (Writing Competition & Grades)

From the remaining applicants, the Managing Editor will select for membership those applicants with the highest scores on their Writing Competition. Up to 25 percent of the incoming Associate Editor class will be selected in this manner, with no other factor considered. The Managing Editor will simultaneously select for membership those applicants with the highest first-year GPAs (excluding legal practice). Up to 25 percent of the incoming Associate Editor class will be selected in this manner, with no other factor considered.

After removing these selected applicants from the pool, the Managing Editor will calculate a weighted average (“Weighted Average”) for each remaining applicant, consisting of her combined Writing Competition score and first-year GPA (including legal practice). In calculating the Weighted Average, the applicant’s combined Writing Competition score will be weighed more heavily than her first-year GPA. The Managing Editor will select for membership those applicants with the highest Weighted Average. 25 to 50 percent of the incoming Associate Editor class will be selected in this manner, with no other factor considered.

After removing these selected applicants from the pool, the 40 remaining applicants with the highest Weighted Average will move on to Round 3.

D. Round 3: Selection of Associate Editors (Short Essays, Writing Competition & Grades)

A committee comprised of the Editor-in-Chief, the Managing Editor, and three other members of the *Law Review* elected by the Editorial Board (“Selection Committee”) will meet in July to review the applications of the remaining applicants. The members of the Selection Committee will not be involved in the grading of Writing Competitions in Round 1.

The Selection Committee will use the remaining applicants’ Short Essays, combined Writing Competition score, and first-year GPA (including Legal Practice) to fill the remainder of the Associate Editor class. The Selection Committee will use all three factors to make this determination, although in this Round, the Short Essays will be considered a particularly important factor. Up to 25% of the incoming Associate Editor class will be selected in this manner.